CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Claire Scheinbaum, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1746, hereby declares under penalty of perjury, that on the 11th day of May, 2009, I caused to be served by electronic mail to Plaintiff's counsel, Susan Amron, and upon counsel for all parties by Lexis Nexis File and Serve a true and correct copy of the Defendants' Reply to Plaintiff City of New York's Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Bar Punitive Damages Based on the Market Share and Commingled Products Theories.

Claire Scheinbaum